

THE UNITED REPUBLIC OF TANZARIA in the shares where he is

and a lot of

2007/08

### CARDEN STATE Education Budget

# 200 /05 2006/07 **EDUCATION SECTOR ANALYSIS**

**Beyond Primary Education, the Quest for Balanced** and Efficient Policy Choices for Human Development and Economic Growth



Regional Bureau for Education in Africa

Educational, Scientific a Cultural Organization **Cluster Office** 





THE UNITED REPUBLIC OF TANZANIA MINISTRY OF EDUCATION AND VOCATIONAL TRAINING

# **EDUCATION SECTOR ANALYSIS**

Beyond Primary Education, the Quest for Balanced and Efficient Policy Choices for Human Development and Economic Growth

## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

2011





The findings, interpretations, and conclusions expressed in this volume do not necessarily reflect the views of the Executive Director of UNESCO or the Government of Tanzania.

## Content

Foreword	14
Acknowledgments	20
Abbreviations	22
Executive Summary	26

#### **CHAPTER 1** THE CONTEXT OF THE EDUICATION SECTOR

THE CONTEXT OF THE EDUCATION CECTOR	00
The Demographic and Social Contexts	58
The Macroeconomic Context	61
Government Finance	63
Total Government Education Expenditure	67
Prospects for Increased Public Education Expenditure	71
Key Findings	73

56

78

83

96

#### **CHAPTER 2** ENROLI MENT AND INTERNAL FEFICIENCY 76 The Structure of the Tanzanian Education System **Enrollment Dynamics by Education Level** School Coverage

Out-of-School Children	107
Key Findings	111

#### **CHAPTER 3**

EDUCATION COST AND FINANCING	116
Public Education Expenditure	120
Household Education Spending	129
Public Recurrent Spending Per Student (Unit Costs)	132
Key Findings	154

#### **CHAPTER 4** QUALITY AND LEARNING OUTCOMES 158

Internal Efficiency of the Education System	160
Learning Outcomes	165
Key Findings	194

#### **CHAPTER 5**

EQUITY IN SCHOOLING	202
Equity in Schooling Patterns	204
Education Supply and Demand Factors	214
Equity in the Distribution of Public Education Resources	228
Key Findings	234

#### CHAPTER 6

EXTERNAL EFFICIENCY	240
Education and Human Development	242
Relevance of Education to the Labor Market	246
Key Findings	263

#### **CHAPTER 7**

268
270
288
299
301

#### **CHAPTER 8**

Linker Education	200
AND VOCATIONAL EDUCATION AND TRAINING	306
MANAGEMENT OF HIGHER, TECHNICAL	

Higher Education Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) Key Findings	308 317 330
CHAPTER 1 ANNEXES	335
CHAPTER 2 ANNEXES CHAPTER 3 ANNEXES	338
CHAPTER 4 ANNEXES	344
CHAPTER 5 ANNEXES	363
CHAPTER 6 ANNEXES	370
CHAPTER 7 ANNEXES	373
CHAPTER 8 ANNEXES	390
References	398

#### List of Figures

GDP Trends, (FY) 1998/99-2008/09 and Projections	63
Trends in Domestic Revenues (Not Including Grants), (FY) 1998/99-2008/09 and Projections	64
Domestic revenues (Not Including Grants), Selected Countries and Subregions, 2008 or MRY	64
Recurrent Expenditures After Debt Service and Domestic Revenue, (FY) 1998/99-2009/10	67
Share of Education in Government Recurrent Expenditure after Debt Service, Selected Countries and Subregions, 2006 or MRY	70
The Structure of the Tanzanian Education System	79
Primary Level Additional Enrollment Intake, over Sets of Two Consecutive School Years, 2000/01-2008/09	85
O-Level Enrollment Trend and Share of Private Sector, 2000-09	86
O-Level Enrollment Intake, over Sets of Two Consecutive School Years, 2000/01-2008/09	86
Distribution of University Students, by Type of Qualification, Academic Year 2009/10	90
Cross-country Comparison of the Relationship between the Development of Higher Education and the Share of Female Students, 2006 or MRY	95
Transversal Schooling Profile, 2003-09	99
Age Distribution of Standard I New Entrants, 2000, 2004 and 2006	100
Comparison of Various African LICs According to their Primary Access and Completion Rates, 2008 or MRY	101
Share of People Having Ever Attended Primary School, by Age, 2006	102
Probabilistic Schooling Profile, 2006	102
Education Pyramids, for SSA and Tanzania, 2009 or MRY	106
School Life Expectancy, Various African Low-income Countries, 2009 or MRY	107
Incidence of Out-Of-School Children (Aged 7-13 Years), by Socioeconomic Characteristic, 2006	108
Probability of Being Out of School, by Household Characteristic, 2006	109
Frequency of Reasons Cited for Nonattendance, Children Aged 7-13 Years, 2006	109
Total Public Education Expenditure, by Implementing Institution, FY2000/01-FY2008/09	119
Real Public Education Expenditure, by Nature, (FY) 2000/01-2008/09	121
The Primary Cycle's Allocation of Public Recurrent Education Expenditure, by PCR, Tanzania and Comparable African Countries, 2006 or MRY	126
	GDP Trends, (FY) 1998/99-2008/09 and Projections Trends in Domestic Revenues (Not Including Grants), (FY) 1998/99-2008/09 and Projections Domestic revenues (Not Including Grants), Selected Countries and Subregions, 2008 or MRY Recurrent Expenditures After Debt Service and Domestic Revenue, (FY) 1998/99-2009/10 Share of Education in Government Recurrent Expenditure after Debt Service, Selected Countries and Subregions, 2006 or MRY The Structure of the Tanzanian Education System Primary Level Additional Enrollment Intake, over Sets of Two Consecutive School Years, 2000/01-2008/09 O-Level Enrollment Trend and Share of Private Sector, 2000-09 O-Level Enrollment Intake, over Sets of Two Consecutive School Years, 2000/01-2008/09 Distribution of University Students, by Type of Qualification, Academic Year 2009/10 Cross-country Comparison of the Relationship between the Development of Higher Education and the Share of Female Students, 2006 or MRY Transversal Schooling Profile, 2003-09 Age Distribution of Standard I New Entrants, 2000, 2004 and 2006 Comparison of Various African LICs According to their Primary Access and Completion Rates, 2008 or MRY Share of People Having Ever Attended Primary School, by Age, 2006 Probabilistic Schooling Profile, 2006 Education Pyramids, for SSA and Tanzania, 2009 or MRY School Life Expectancy, Various African Low-income Countries, 2009 or MRY Incidence of Out-Of-School Children (Aged 7-13 Years), by Socioeconomic Characteristic, 2006 Probabilisti of Being Out of School, by Household Characteristic, 2006 Frequency of Reasons Cited for Nonattendance, Children Aged 7-13 Years, 2006 Frequency of Reasons Cited for Nonattendance, Children Aged 7-13 Years, 2006 Frequency of Reasons Cited for Nonattendance, Children Aged 7-13 Years, 2006 Frequency of Reasons Cited for Nonattendance, Children Aged 7-13 Years, 2006 Frequency of Reasons Cited for Nonattendance, Children Expenditure, by PCR, Tanzania and Comparable African Countries, 2006 or MRY

Figure 3.4	The Secondary Cycle's Allocation of Public Recurrent Education Expenditure, by PCR, Tanzania and Comparable African Countries, 2006 or MRY	127
Figure 3.5	Higher Education's Allocation of Public Recurrent Education Expenditure, Sample of African Low-Income Countries, 2006 or MRY	128
Figure 3.6	TVET's Allocation of Public Recurrent Education Expenditure, by Coverage, Tanzania and Comparable African Countries, 2006 or MRY	129
Figure 3.7	International Comparison of Household Spending on Education, by Level, 2009 or MRY	131
Figure 3.8	Direct Household Spending per Student, by Level, (FY) 2000/01 and 2007/08	132
Figure 3.9	Secondary Education Public Unit Costs, (FY) 2000/01-2008/09	134
Figure 3.10	Cross-Country Comparison of Public Higher Education Unit Costs, 2006 or MRY	139
Figure 3.11	Other Charges Direct Subsidy per Student (OC Unit Cost), for Selected Public Technical Training Institutions, by Subject Area, 2008/09	140
Figure 3.12	Economies of Scale in University Other Charges per Student, 2008/09	141
Figure 3.13	Composition of VET Management-Related Costs, 2009	145
Figure 3.14	TVET Public Recurrent Unit Costs, Selected African Low-income Countries, 2006 or MRY	148
Figure 4.1	Primary Level Repetition Trends, 2000-09	161
Figure 4.2	Proportion of Primary and Secondary Repetition, by Subsector and Grade, 2009	162
Figure 4.3	Proportion of Primary and Secondary Repetition, Various African Countries, 2006 or MRY	162
Figure 4.4	Probability of Adult Literacy (22-44 Years), by Highest Grade Completed, 2004	165
Figure 4.5	Number of PSLE Candidates and Share of Female Candidates, 2000-09	167
Figure 4.6	PSLE Grade Distribution, Core Subjects, 2009	168
Figure 4.7	PSLE Grade Distribution, Core Subjects, by Gender, 2009	169
Map 4.1	PSLE Pass Rate, by Region, 2009	169
Figure 4.8	SACMEQ Reading and Mathematics Scores, 2007	171
Figure 4.9	Distribution of SACMEQ Reading (Kiswahili) and Mathematics Results, by Level, 2000 and 2007	172
Figure 4.10	Share of Students Reaching the Minimum Level (Level 4) in Reading (Kiswahili) and Mathematics, by Socioeconomic Characteristic, 2000-07	173
Figure 4.11	Comparison of Teachers' and Pupils' SACMEQ Reading and Mathematics Scores, 2007	177
Figure 4.12	Distribution of the Effect of Pupil, Teacher and School Characteristics on Pupils' SACMEQ Reading and Mathematics Scores, 2007	178
Figure 4.13	Number of CSEE Candidates and Share of Female Candidates, 2000-09	179
Figure 4.14	CSEE Pass Rates, by Type of Candidate, 2000-09	180
Figure 4.15	Distribution of CSEE Pass Grades, by Type of Graduate and Gender, 2009	181
Figure 4.16	Distribution of School Candidates' CSEE Grades, by Core Subject, 2009	182
Figure 4.17	Number of ACSEE Candidates, and Share of Female and Private Candidates, 2000-09	185

Figure 4.18 Figure 4.19 Figure 4.20 Figure 4.21 Figure 4.22	ACSEE Pass Rates, by Type of Candidate, 2000-09 Distribution of ACSEE Pass Grades, by Type of Graduate and Gender, 2009 VET Pass Rates, for Long Course Tests, 2001-08 Distribution of Technical Education Examination Pass Scores, by Award, 2008 Distribution of Higher Education Pass Scores, by Award type, 2008	186 186 189 190 192
Figure 5.1	Probabilistic Profiles by Gender, Location, and Income Group, 2006	207
Figure 5.2	Regional Disparities in Primary Access and Retention Probabilities, 2006	211
Figure 5.3	Regional Disparities in Primary Retention and Primary-Secondary Transition Probabilities, 2006	212
Figure 5.4	Schooling Disparities, EAC and LIC Countries, 2006 or MRY	213
Figure 5.5	Odds Ratios for Primary Access, Primary Retention and Secondary Access, 2006	215
Figure 5.6	Primary Access in Relation to the Distance to a Primary School, by Region, 2006	216
Figure 5.7	Secondary Access in Relation to the Distance to a Secondary School, by Region, 2006	217
Figure 5.8	Age Distribution of Standards I and VII Students, by Area of Residence, 2006	221
Map 5.1	Impact of Supply or Demand Factors in Primary Access, by Region, 2006	224
Map 5.2	Impact of Supply or Demand Factors in Primary Retention, by Region, 2006	225
Map 5.3	Impact of Supply or Demand Factors in Secondary Access, by Region, 2006	226
Map 5.4	Location of HLIs, by Region, 2010	228
Figure 5.9	Lorenz Curve for Tanzania, 2009	230
Figure 5.10	Share of Public Resources Absorbed by the 10 Percent Most Educated, Various African Countries, 2009 or MRY	230
Figure 5.11	Disparity in the Distribution of Public Education Resources, by Level of Income, Area of Residence, and Gender, Various SSA Countries, 2009 of MRY	233
Figure 6.1	Relationship between Education, Income and Behavior	242
Figure 6.2	Comparison of Higher Education Enrollment Trends and Projections, Tanzania and Regional Pattern, 2006-25	252
Figure 6.3	Distribution of Surveyed VET Graduates, by Employment Sector, 2010	258
Figure 6.4	Employment Rate of VET Graduates, by Sector, 2010	259
Figure 7.1	Primary Level PTRs, by School Type, 2000-09	275
Figure 7.2	Average PTRs in Government Primary Schools, SADC Countries, 2007 or MRY	276
Map 7.1	Government School Pupil-Teacher Ratios, by Region, 2000	277
Map 7.2	Government School Pupil-Teacher Ratios, by Region, 2009	278
Figure 7.3	Over and Under Supply of Government School Teachers at the District Level, by Region, 2009	279
Figure 7.4	Shares of Qualified and Female Teachers in Government Primary Schools, by Region, 2009	281

Figure 7.5	Coherence in the Allocation of Primary Teachers among Government Schools, 2007	282
Figure 7.6	Degree of Randomness (1-R <sup>2</sup> ) in Government Primary School Teacher Allocation, Subsample of African Countries, 2006 or MRY	283
Figure 7.7	Availability of English Books, by Region, 2009	285
Figure 7.8	Coherence in the District-Level Availability of English Books, for Public Primary Schools, 2009	286
Figure 7.9	Public Secondary Pupil-Teacher Ratios, Various African Countries, 2009 or MRY	292
Map 7.3	O-Level Pupil-Teacher Ratios (Government schools), by Region, 2009	293
Map 7.4	O-Level Pupil-Qualified Teacher Ratios (Government schools), by Region, 2009	294
Figure 7.10	Coherence in the Allocation of O-Level Teachers among Government Schools, 2009	295
Figure 7.11	Degree of Randomness (1-R <sup>2</sup> ) in Public O-Level Teacher Allocation, Various African Countries, 2006 or MRY	296
Figure 7.12	Degree of Randomness (1-R <sup>2</sup> ) in O-Level Government school Teacher Allocation, by Region, 2009	296
Figure 7.13	Relationship between SACMEQ Scores and Primary Level Unit Costs, 2009	299
Figure 7.14	Relationship between CSEE Pass Rates and Secondary Level Unit Costs, 2009	300
Figure 8.1	Distribution of HLI Teaching Staff, by Category, 2009/10	314

#### List of Tables

Table 1.1	Demographic Trends in Tanzania, 1967-2002 and Projections through 2020	59
Table 1.2	International Comparison of Demographic and Social Trends, 2008 or MRY	60
Table 1.3	Gross Domestic Product, (FY) 1998/99-2008/09 and Projections	62
Table 1.4	Overall Government Revenue, (FY) 1998/99-2009/10	65
Table 1.5	Trends in Government Expenditure, (FY) 1998/99-2009/10	66
Table 1.6	Actual Public Education Expenditure, (FY) 2000/01-2008/09	68
Table 1.7	Actual Public Education Expenditure in Macroeconomic Perspective, (FY)	60
	2000/01-2009/10 and projections	69
Table 1.8	Scenarios of Education's Share of Recurrent Expenditure, FY 2019/20 Projections	72
Table 2.1	Enrollment by Level, 2000-09	84
Table 2.2	Enrollment in Technical Institutions, by Subject Area, 2006/07 and 2009/10	88
T-1-1-2-2	Line with Free Barrier A Tree do the Channel (New York) and the distribution of the	
Iadie 2.3	the Share of Science Courses, 2003/04-2009/10	89

Table 2.4 Table 2.5 Table 2.6 Table 2.7 Table 2.8 Table 2.9 Table 2.10 Table 2.11 Table 2.12 Table 2.13	Enrollment Growth Rates, by Level/Subsector, 2000-09 Share of Students Enrolled in Nongovernmental Institutions, 2000-09 International Comparison of the Share of Private Sector Enrollment, 2006 or MRY Share of Female Student Enrollment, 2000-09 Schooling Coverage, by Level, 2003-09 International Comparison of Enrollment, by Level, 2008 or MRY Evolution of the Primary Completion Rate, 2003-09 Primary to A-Level Effective Transition Rates, by Level, 2002/03-2008/09 Trends in Pass and Transition Rates, 2000-09 Distribution of Out-of-School Children (Aged 7-13 Years), by Socioeconomic Characteristic, 2006	92 93 94 95 97 98 100 103 104
Table 3.1	Actual Public Education Expenditure, by Nature, (FY) 2000/01-2008/09	120
Table 3.2	Distribution of Actual Public Education Expenditure, by Nature and Subsector, (FY) 2000/01-2008/09	123
Table 3.3	Reclassification of Public Recurrent Education Expenditure among Postsecondary Levels, FY 2008/09	124
Table 3.4	Comparison of the Allocation of Public Recurrent Education Expenditure, by Cycle, Tanzania and Selected African Countries' Average, 2006 or MRY	125
Table 3.5	Household Spending on Education, by Level, FY 2008/09	130
Table 3.6	Public Spending per Student, by Level, (FY) 2000/01 and 2008/09	133
Table 3.7	HESLB Loans Disbursed, by Level, FY 2008/09	135
Table 3.8	Reconstructed Public Recurrent Expenditure for Higher and Technical Education, by Level, Source, and Type of Expense, FY 2008/09	136
Table 3.9	Higher and Technical Education Public Unit Costs, by Level and Composition, FY 2008/09	137
Table 3.10	Other Charges Direct Subsidy per Student in Technical Institutions, by Subject Area, FY 2008/09	138
Table 3.11	Social Expenditures, by Level and Type of Institution, FY 2008/09	142
Table 3.12	Distribution of Folk Education Public Recurrent Expenditure, by Key Item, FY 2008/09	144
Table 3.13	Value and Distribution of VETA Public Recurrent Expenditure, by Key Item, 2001 and 2009	145
Table 3.14	VETA Income, by Source, 2001 and 2009	146
Table 3.15	Vocational Education and TVET Public Recurrent Unit Costs, FY 2008/09	147
Table 3.16	Composition of Basic Education Public Recurrent Expenditure, by Subsector, FY 2008/09	149
Table 3.17	Capitation Grants per Student, for Primary and Secondary Schools, (FY) 2004/05-2009/10	150
Table 3.18	Average Salaries and Personnel Emoluments, According to the Teacher Salary Scale, 2009	151

Table 3.19	Average Primary and Secondary Teachers' Salary Ranges and Level, by Qualification, 2009	152
Table 4.1	Primary and Secondary Schooling Internal Efficiency Coefficients, 2000–09	163
Table 4.2	Primary and Secondary Schooling Internal Efficiency Coefficients, Various African LICs, by Cycle and Level, 2009 or MRY	164
Table 4.3	PSLE Candidates and Pass Rate, by Gender, and Gender Parity Index, 2000-09	167
Table 4.4	SACMEQ Reading (Kiswahili) and Math Scores and Share of Pupils Reaching Minimum Skill Levels, 2000-2007	170
Table 4.5	The Effect of Socioeconomic Factors on SACMEQ Scores, 2007	175
Table 4.6	CSEE Pass Rate, by Type of Candidate and Gender, 2006-09	180
Table 4.7	School Candidates CSEE Pass Rates and Score Distribution, by Type of School, 2009	181
Table 4.8	Main Determinants of CSEE Pass Rates, 2009	183
Table 4.9	Number and Proportion of VET Long Course Learners Completing their Year, by Gender, 2006-08	187
Table 4.10	Number and Proportion of VET Long Course Learners Completing their Year, by Gender and Type of Training Center, 2007	188
Table 4.11	Number and Share of VET Exam Candidates, by Test Entered, 2005-08	189
Table 4.12	Technical Education Examination Finalists, Graduates, and Pass Rates, by Type of Award and Gender, 2008	190
Table 4.13	Distribution of Technical Education Pass Results, by Award Type, Gender and Ownership, 2008	191
Table 4.14	Higher Education Examination Finalists, Graduates and Examination Pass Rates, by Award, 2008	, 192
Table 4.15	Distribution of Higher Education Pass Scores, by Award Type and Gender, 2008	193
Table 4.16	Potential Measures to Improve Basic Education Learning Achievements, and their Related Impact and Cost	196
lable 5.1	Gross Enrollment Ratios and Parity Indexes, by Gender, Area of Residence, and Level of Income, 2006	206
Table 5.2	Cumulated Disparities in Schooling Profiles, by Extreme Group, 2006	208
Table 5.3	Disparities in Primary and Secondary Access Probabilities, by Socioeconomic Group, 2000 and 2006	209
Table 5.4	Disparities in Retention and Transition Probabilities in Primary and Secondary Education, 2006	212
Table 5.5	Distance to the Closest Primary School, by Area of Residence, 2006	216
Table 5.6	Distribution of School-Aged Children According to the Distance to the Closest Secondary School, by Area of Residence, 2000 and 2006	217
Table 5.7	Number of O-Level Schools per 100,000 School-Aged Children (13-24 Years), and Supply Growth, by Region, 2004 and 2009	219
Table 5.8	Main Reasons for Dropout, Primary and Secondary Levels, by Gender and Area of Residence, 2006	222

Table 5.9	Distribution of VTCs by Region, 2008	227
lable 5.10	Distribution of Public Education Resources among a Theoretical Cohort of 100 School-Aged Individuals, 2008-09	229
Table 5.11	Distribution of the School-Aged Population (6-30 Years), by Socioeconomic Status, Location, Gender, and Highest Level Attained, 2006	231
Table 5.12	Benefit Incidence of Public Education Resources, by Level of Income, Area of Residence, and Gender, 2009	232
Table 6.1	Simulated Net Impact of Education on Social Behavior in Tanzania, 2004-05	243
Table 6.2	Relative Impact of Primary and Secondary Education Levels on Social Behaviors, by Indicator and Strength of Impact, 2004-05	245
Table 6.3	Human Development Related Cost-Efficiency of Education, by Level, 2004-05	246
Table 6.4	Employment, Unemployment and Inactivity, with Ratios, 2001 and 2006	247
Table 6.5	Distribution of Employment, by Sector, 2001 and 2006	248
Table 6.6	Education Profile of the Labor Force, by Highest Level Attained and Age-Group, 2001 and 2006	249
Table 6.7	Employment Status of the Labor Force (25-35 Years), by Level of Education, 2006	250
Table 6.8	Projected Higher Education Enrollment Growth, by Catch-up Scenario, 2015, 2020 and 2025	253
Table 6.9	Workers' Average Income and Years of Schooling (15-60 Years), Salaried and Self-Employment, 2006	254
Table 6.10	Annual Income, by Education Attainment and Employment Sector, 2006	255
Table 6.11	Long Course TVET Enrollment and Potential Demand, 2009	256
Table 6.12	Reasons Stated by VET Graduates for Unemployment, 2010	260
Table 6.13	Expected Earnings of VET Graduates, and Share below the Poverty Line, by Sector, 2010	261
Table 6.14	Comparison of VET Graduates' and Self-Employed Income, by Sector, 2006	262
Table 7.1	Primary School Teacher Characteristics, by School Type, 2000-09	272
Table 7.2	Attrition and its Main Causes, Primary School Teachers, by Gender and Teacher Qualification, 2008	274
Table 7.3	Ranking of Regions by Average PTR, Government Primary Schools, 2000 and 2009	279
Table 7.4	Ranking of Regions According to the Share of Primary Government School Qualified Teachers, 2000 and 2009	281
Table 7.5	Textbook Availability in Government Primary Schools, by Grade, 2009	284
Table 7.6	Secondary School Teacher Characteristics, by School Type, 2000-09	289
Table 7.7	Diploma-Level Teacher Trainees in TTCs, by Type of Training, 2000-09	290
Table 7.8	Share of Secondary Teacher Subject Specializations, by Gender and School	
	Ownership, 2000-09	290
Table 7.9	Secondary Level PTRs and PqTRs, by School Type, 2000-09	291

Table 7.10 Table 7.11	Secondary Level PTRs and PqTRs, by Subsector and School Type, 2009 Textbook Availability at O-Level, by Type of School and Subject, 2009	292 297
Table 8.1	Distribution of Student Loans, by Amount Granted, 2009/10	311
Table 8.2	Age Distribution of HLI Teaching Staff, 2009/10	312
Table 8.3	Teaching and Administrative Staff Numbers, and Share of Female, by HLI Type and Name, 2009/10	313
Table 8.4	Student-Teacher and Student-Administrative Staff Ratios, by HLI Type and Name, 2009/10	316
Table 8.5	Registration and Accreditation Status of HLIs, 2009	319
Table 8.6	Distribution of TE Registered Teaching Staff, by Qualification, 2008/09	322
Table 8.7	Age Distribution of Technical Teaching Staff, 2008/09	322
Table 8.8	Number of VTCs by Registration Status, 2008	326
Table 8.9	Distribution of VET Training Centers, by Type, Ownership and Region, 2008	327

## Foreword

his education sector analysis (ESA) for mainland Tanzania is a detailed analytical document that offers a comprehensive picture of mainland Tanzania's education sector. The main purpose of an ESA (also known as Country Status Report, or CSR) is to provide an evidence-based diagnosis of an education sector, to enable decision-makers to orient national policies. It also provides relevant analytical information to nourish the dialogue between the government and education sector stakeholders, including development partners. In the current development context, marked by the necessity for countries to develop sound, sustainable and credible strategies and plans in which education is embedded, ESAs represent a valuable and essential tool.

This is the second ESA for Tanzania; the first one having been conducted in 2001. Although its main objective is to provide a comprehensive picture of the education system in 2009 (the last year for which statistics were available), it also provides some analysis of the evolution of the system over the decade, when feasible and relevant. This second report is also more than an update. It provides more in-depth analysis on certain aspects of the system: detailed unit costs by subsector, external efficiency, quality and out-of-school, and technical education and vocational training and higher education in particular. It provides key monitoring and evaluation inputs on the education sector as a whole, that are particularly valuable in the framework of the implementation of the Education Sector Development Programme.

This 2011 ESA was carried out between February 2009 and November 2010 by a multiministerial national team with the support of the Pôle de Dakar (UNESCO/BREDA) and the UNESCO Institute of Statistics. It was part of the activities conducted under the Education Sector Management Information System (ESMIS) Programme,<sup>1</sup> one goal of which is to support the development of capacities in data analysis using data generated by the ESMIS and other sources to strengthen sector-wide planning and policy reforms. The ESA process contributed to the strategy for building capacities in data analysis through a combination of: (i) learning-by-doing, through a series of workshops, and (ii) theoretical training sessions, offered in parallel to the workshops by the Bureau of Educational Research and Evaluation of the University of Dar es Salaam (BERE/UDSM), based on the SAMES<sup>2</sup> materials provided by the Pôle de Dakar. The analyses presented in this ESA were made possible by using existing data and information from multiple sources, and more particularly: school administrative surveys conducted by the Ministry of Education and Vocational Training (BEST, TCU and NACTE data); household budget, labor force, demographic and health surveys conducted by the National Bureau of Statistics; and SACMEQ data on learning achievements, including examination data from NECTA. Macroeconomic data and government finance statistics were provided by MoFEA, and specific data were made available from VETA and the HESLB. Obtaining timely (household surveys, SACMEQ, and payroll data) and reliable key data (EMIS data were fraught with flaws) was a major constraint that has heavily limited the scope of some analyses. Nevertheless, some important conclusions have been reached, both on the achievement front, and on the major challenges faced by the education system.

The 2011 ESA has highlighted some interesting achievements, including:

- Sustained economic growth and greater public resources have translated into a relatively higher education budget. The government spent 4.3 percent of GDP on education in FY 2008/09 (from a low 2.5 percent in FY 2000/01), much more than countries with similar levels of development. Education has also been given high budget priority. The sector benefited from 26.5 percent of recurrent government expenditure after debt service in FY 2008/09, well above the African low-income countries' average of 21.4 percent;
- Tanzania is on track to achieve the millennium development goal of universal primary education. Access is almost universal and the primary completion rate is close to 90 percent. The fee-free primary education policy has had a positive impact by boosting both access and retention. Tanzania's preprimary gross enrollment ratio is close to 37 percent, compared with just 20 percent on average for comparable African countries. Tanzania's administration of this level, using similar teaching approaches as for the primary cycle and similar school premises, has helped to lower unit costs and increase enrollment;

- Enrollment has increased for all cycles, and particularly in higher education, allowing Tanzania to rapidly catch up with the levels of comparable developing countries: in 2009, the number of higher education students in Tanzania was 36 percent lower than the average, down from 50 percent in 2006. This trend is likely to continue as a direct consequence of the expected development of secondary education;
- The Tanzanian higher education and TVET sectors are well positioned to adequately manage the development and diversification of supply. Existing policies and regulatory bodies provide a sufficient, solid and modern institutional framework for the system to build upon for its future development;
- Education has a significant impact on social and human development, particularly on literacy, poverty, fertility, and maternal and child health. Primary education is the level that has the greatest impact on social outcomes: it contributes to almost 60 percent of the total impact, which further reinforces the justification for sustained efforts to ensure that all Tanzanian children complete at least the primary cycle; and
- Education responds to labor market needs. Greater levels of education lead to higher incomes. The wage premium for workers with secondary education is particularly significant, suggesting that there is a severe shortage of individuals with secondary qualifications. There is also a strong connection between vocational training and graduates' employment. In general, the income of VET graduates compares favorably with that of self-employed individuals with primary education or O-Level secondary.

The 2011 ESA also points to key challenges in the coming years for the development of the education sector in Tanzania, including:

- Achieving greater efficiency gains (or implementing cost-saving strategies) in the use of public education resources. Indeed, it is unlikely that the current level of budget priority given to the education sector will be maintained over the next decade, due to competing demands by health, agriculture and infrastructure;
- Increasing the public resources allocated to secondary education. Tanzania's secondary cycle receives 35 percent less funding than countries who are equally close to achieving universal primary education. This situation should be carefully reviewed to avoid affecting quality as the sector expands. Secondary schools already display high pupil to teacher ratios (49 to 1);
- Ensuring children enter primary school at the right age. Approximately 13 percent of primary school-aged children were still out of school in 2006, 88 percent of which had never attended. Although poverty is a constraint, age appeared to be the main reason for nonattendance. Late primary entry is common (only 36 percent of Standard I students were of official school age seven years in 2006) and is known to have a detrimental impact on schooling paths;

- Improving access to and retention in secondary cycles. Although considerable improvements in access to secondary school have been noted, especially at O-Level, they are still limited. In 2009, half of children had access to O-Level and 23 percent were able to reach the last grade of the cycle, up from just eight percent in 2003. A-Level access is still strikingly low, at five percent. Whereas lack of supply is a major hindrance to O-Level and A-Level access, economic difficulties and cultural issues among certain population groups also contribute to fragile school demand. The policy to have a secondary school in each ward has had a very positive impact on secondary access and on primary retention rates;
- Supporting pro-poor schooling. Important disparities in access exist according to gender and area of residence, and they increase with successive levels of education, but the most discriminatory factor in schooling patterns is families' level of income. It has also been shown that households' contributions to education are still significant at the primary level (equivalent to a quarter of public resources), despite the fee-free primary education policy. Furthermore, disadvantages tend to be cumulative. Poor rural girls face the worst access and retention conditions;
- Taking affirmative action to enhance girls' participation in school to ensure gender parity at postprimary levels. Insistence on girls fulfilling their traditional role in society, early marriage and pregnancy all favor dropout. Trends could be reversed by: (i) awareness raising campaigns to sensitize parents on the value of educating girls beyond primary, and on the negative impact of early marriage and pregnancy on schooling and female health; (ii) greater numbers of female teachers and the provision of community-based hostels to avoid girls the long journeys to and from school, addressing security concerns; and (iii) scholarships and cash transfers targeting bright girls, reducing direct and opportunity costs, mirroring the government's programme targeting the most talented primary graduates from poorer backgrounds;
- *Improving pedagogical management* to raise the quality of basic education. Although the improvement dynamic observed in primary education learning outcomes between 2000 and 2007 is very encouraging, and better than in neighboring countries, learning achievements are still modest by international standards. In addition, national examination pass rates are dropping, and the results of those who graduate are low, especially at primary and O-Level;
- *Reducing disparities between regions, districts and schools,* that persist despite decentralization, highlighting the need for effective planning and monitoring tools to allocate education inputs more efficiently. A decentralized information and monitoring system could help by providing decision makers with timely, accurate and reliable data on the education sector. In addition to an EMIS system, financial and human resource management systems would improve fiscal management and accountability. A first response to this challenge was given in 2009, with the development of a pilot decentralized Basic-Education Management Information System (BE-MIS). Tested in 28 district councils in 14 regions, the BE-MIS is to be scaled up to all councils nationwide by 2014; and

• Adequate planning of TVET and higher education expansion. The increase in primary and secondary school enrollments is already placing much strain on secondary, TVET and higher education institutions. An urgent response is required to ensure the smooth and manageable development of these subsectors.

The challenges faced by higher education are of particular importance:

- It is essential that funding mechanisms be improved. Higher education is blatantly inefficient, paying little attention to potential economies of scale. In addition, approximately 28 percent of the level's budget is devoted to badly targeted social expenditures, particularly loans transferred directly to students: 48 percent of students benefit from a loan, yet less than 10 percent come from the poorest quintiles, which calls for an improvement in the loan targeting mechanisms; and
- Students' career objectives and the distribution of graduates by subject area must be adjusted, to achieve better relevancy of higher education programmes to the labor market and enable Tanzania to keep abreast of rapid technological development and needs. Science subjects in particular attract too few students (only 24 percent of students for the 2007/08 academic year, down from 34 percent in 2003/04). Adequate analytical tools should be implemented, such as labor market tracer surveys.

Technical education and vocational training will also be key to Tanzania's development. Some of the key required actions that this ESA highlights for the subsector include:

- Strengthening the subsector's coordination mechanisms. Although regulatory and quality assurance bodies provide important guarantees for the controlled development of the TVET subsector, it still faces a series of challenges, including: (i) the diversity of training demand linked to the heterogeneity of the target population; (ii) the institutional fragmentation of technical education, under the umbrella of various ministries; (iii) the fragmentation of vocational education and training service delivery, involving two ministries and a parastatal agency; and (iv) the practical continuity between vocational and technical curricula and programmes, although theoretically bridges do exist, as defined by the national qualifications' framework;
- *Revising subsector budget trade-offs.* The Tanzanian TVET system as a whole is not as underfunded as in many other African countries. However, technical nonhigher education absorbs almost 57 percent of all TVET resources, against just 37 percent for vocational training, and six percent for folk education. This funding imbalance should be reduced in order to scale-up vocational education and training activities; and

• Defining a funding formula to rationalize the allocation of resources among technical institutions. Surprisingly, it has been noticed that planning and welfare courses are twice as expensive as health and allied science courses. However, even for a given subject area, and among institutions with comparable levels of enrollment, variations in the resources allocated are sizeable. This situation merits an improved funding formula and for more coordination in planning and budgeting among parent ministries.

More broadly, this ESA offers valuable and comprehensive resources to anyone interested in the education sector in Tanzania. It is however a snapshot of the system at a particular time. As the sector makes progress in implementing its sector plan, this report's findings are therefore likely to become outdated, although many features will remain valid. It is the hope of both the Ministry of Education and development partners that this document will be of use to all stakeholders in the education sector.

Dr. Shukuru Kawambwa (MP) Minister of Education and Vocational Training Tanzania

Vibeke Jensen Director and Representative UNESCO Dar es Salaam Office for Comoros, Madagascar, Mauritius, Seychelles and Tanzania

Ann Therese Ndong-Jatta Director Regional Bureau for Education in Africa UNESCO

- 1 The Education Sector Management Information System (ESMIS) Programme is implemented by the government of Tanzania with the financial and technical support of development partners (the European Union, UNESCO, UNICEF, and UNFPA), within the overall framework of the Education Sector Development Programme for 2008-17. The UNESCO Institute of Statistics is providing technical assistance through its permanent Dar es Salaam cluster office.
- 2 The Sectoral Analysis and Management of the Education System (SAMES), also known as the PSGSE (Politiques Sectorielles et de Gestion des Systèmes Educatifs) is a masters degree offered by the University Cheikh Anta Diop of Dakar (Senegal) with the support of the Pôle de Dakar, targeting Ministry of Education staff and other actors working in the field of education in Africa. The training is currently available in French. An English course is currently under development with the University of The Gambia. For the purpose of this ESA, all training modules were translated into English and made available to BERE.

## Acknowledgments

This Education Sector Analysis was prepared through a close collaborative effort by the government of Tanzania, the Pôle de Dakar (UNESCO/BREDA), the UNESCO Institute of Statistics, and the UNESCO Dar es Salaam cluster office.

The government team consisted of staff from the different ministries in charge of education, led by the Ministry of Education and Vocational Training (MoEVT), as well as other ministries and departments, including the Ministry of Community Development, Gender and Children (MCDGC), the Ministry of Finance and Economic Affairs (MoFEA), the Prime Minister's Office for Regional Administration and Local Government (PMO-RALG), the National Examinations Council of Tanzania (NECTA), the National Council for Technical Education (NACTE), the Tanzania Commission for Universities (TCU), the Vocational Education and Training Authority (VETA), the National Bureau of Statistics (NBS) and the Bureau for Educational Research and Education of the University of Dar es Salaam (BERE/UDSM), which was instrumental in facilitating all theoretical workshops.

The government team was successively led by Cyprian Miyedu, former Chief of the Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E) Section, Department of Policy and Planning of MoEVT, the late George Maliga, Chief of the M&E Section of MoEVT, and Muhwela Kalinga, Acting Chief, M&E Section, under the overall leadership of Professor H.O. Dihenga, the Permanent Secretary of MOEVT. Related administrative issues were handled by Mr Malili and Ms Levira. For Chapters 1 and 3, the government ESA team consisted of Ms Baitwa (Chapters head, Budget and Finance Division, MoEVT), Ms Elinzu (NBS), Mr Kitali (PMO-RALG), Ms Luena (EMIS, MoEVT), Mr Minja (Administration and Personnel, MoEVT), Mr Mtyama (MoEFA), Ms Omolo (TMC-DPLO/LGA Temeke District Council) and Mr Zullu (Administration and Personnel, MoEVT). Mr Pambe (Chapters head, Primary Education, MoEVT), Ms Kiisheweko (TCU), Ms Levira (Adult Education, MoEVT), Mr Maiga (Adult Education, MoEVT), Mr Mchunguzi (Higher Education, MoEVT), Ms Sigwejo (NACTE), Mr Saro (FDC, MCDGC) and Mr Wilberforce (EMIS, MOEVT) constituted the government team for Chapters 2 and 5. The team for Chapter 6 included Mr Mhagama (Chapter head, VETA Division, MoEVT), Mr Misana (Technical Education, MoEVT), Mr Malili (Higer Education, MoEVT), Mr Mwakapalala (NBS), Mr Ndamgoba (FDC, MCDGC), Mr Petro (EMIS, MoEVT) and Mr Sunday (MIS, MCDGC). The government team for Chapters 4, 7 and 8 was composed of Mr Mwenda (Chapters head, Secondary Education, MoEVT), Mr Gabriel (LGA Bagamoyo, PMO-RALG),

Mr Kinunda (Higher Education, MoEVT), Mr Nzoka (Teacher Training, MoEVT), Mr Mbowe (NECTA), Ms Mrigo (Administration and Personnel, MoEVT), Mr Pambe (Primary Education, MoEVT), Mr Ponera (EMIS, MoEVT) and Mr Shauri (Primary Education, MoEVT). Chapter 7 received additional inputs from staff from the Inspection Department of MoEVT.

The Pôle de Dakar (UNESCO/BREDA) team consisted of Borel Foko (Team Leader, Education Policy Analyst) and Diane Coury (Education Policy Analyst), under the overall guidance of Jean-Pierre Jarousse (former Head of the Pôle de Dakar) and Mohammed Bougroum (Head of the Pôle de Dakar). Inputs were also provided by the Pôle members Alain Patrick Nkengne Nkengne, Mireille Harivola Ravelojaona and Ibrahima Dao.

The team received constant support from the UIS team of the UNESCO Dar es Salaam cluster office, which consisted of Marc Bernal (UIS Regional Advisor for Eastern and Southern Africa), Criana Connal (former EMIS Programme Specialist) and Erick Makoye and Abdulatif Min-Hajj (IT specialists). Special thanks are due to Marc Bernal and Criana Connal who provided strong support and facilitated the policy dialogue throughout the process.

The UNESCO Dar es Salaam cluster office was also instrumental in the effective elaboration of the ESA. The team would particularly like to thank Min Jeong Kim (Education Programme Specialist) who helped complete the process and Flora Rusenene and Rahma Islem for their constant administrative support. Special thanks are due to Barnaby Rooke for the editing work and Regis L'Hostis for the graphic design.

The team received valuable comments from the peer reviewers Criana Connal, Jean-Pierre Jarousse, Jean-Marc Bernard, Agripina Habicht, Monica Githaiga, and Joseph Vere, as well as from the development partner groups led by Corey Huntington (Canadian High Commission).

The preparation of this report was funded by the Education Management Information System (EMIS) Programme, financially supported by multiple donors, under the administrative responsibility of the UIS/UNESCO-Dar es Salaam cluster office, and by the Pôle de Dakar (UNESCO/BREDA).

# Abbreviations

ACSEE	Advanced Certificate of Secondary Education Examination
A-Level	Advanced Level
AE/NFE	Adult Education and Nonformal Education
AKU	Aga Khan University
ARU	Ardhi University
<b>BE-MIS</b>	Basic Education - Management Information System
BEST	Basic Education Statistics in Tanzania
CBET	Competence-Based Education and Training
COBET	Complementary Basic Education in Tanzania
CPRS	Contrats Programme de Réussite Scolaire (School Performance Contract)
CSEE	Certificate of Secondary Education Examination
DbyD	Decentralization by Devolution
DEO	District Education Officer
DSE	Department of Secondary Education of MoVET
DUCE	Dar es Salaam University College of Education
EAC	East African Community
EFA	Education For All
ECCD	Early Childhood Care and Development
EMAC	Educational Material Approval Committee of MoEVT
EMIS	Education Management Information System
FBO	Faith-Based Organization
FDC	Folk Development College
FY	Fiscal Year
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GER	Gross Enrollment Rate
GPI	Gender Parity Index
HBS	Household and Budget Survey
HE	Higher Education
HEDP	Higher Education Development Programme
HESLB	Higher Education Student Loan Board
ΗΚΜυ	Hubert Kairuki Memorial University
HLI	Higher Learning Institution

IAE	Institute of Adult Education
ICBAE	Integrated Community-Based Adult Education
ICT	Information and Communication Technology
IEC	Internal Efficiency Coefficient
IIEP	International Institute for Educational Planning
IMF	International Monetary Fund
IMTU	International Medical & Technological University
IUCO	Iringa University College
КСК	Postbasic Literacy (ICBAE component)
KCM	Basic Literacy (ICBAE component)
KCMC	Kilimanjaro Christ Medical College
LGA	Local Government Authority
LGRP	Local Government Reform Programme
LIC	Low-Income Country
LOITASA	Language of Instruction in Tanzania and South Africa - A research project
MCDGC	Ministry of Community Development, Gender and Children
MCST	Ministry of Communication, Science and Technology
MDAs	Ministries and Department Agencies
MDRI	Multilateral Debt Relief Initiative
MEM	Ministry of Energy and Minerals
MHA	Ministry of Home Affairs
MHEST	Ministry of Higher Education, Science and Technology
MHSW	Ministry of Health and Social Welfare
MICS	Ministry of Information, Culture and Sports
MID	Ministry of Infrastructure Development
MITM	Ministry of Industry, Trade and Marketing
MJCA	Ministry of Justice and Constitutional Affairs
MLFD	Ministry of Livestock and Fisheries Development
MLHHSP	Ministry of Lands, Housing and Human Settlements Development
MMU	Mount Meru University
MNRT	Ministry of Natural Resources and Tourism
MoEVT	Ministry of Education and Vocational Iraining
Mofea	Ministry of Finance and Economic Affairs

MRY	Most Recent Year
MUCCOBS	Moshi University College of Cooperative and Business Studies
MUCE	Mkwawa University College
MUCO	Makumira University College
MUHAS	Muhimbili University of Health & Allied Sciences
MUM	Muslim University of Morogoro
MWUCE	Mwenge University College
MU	Mzumbe University
NABE	National Business Examinations
NACTE	National Council for Technical Education
NBS	National Bureau of Statistics
NECTA	National Examinations Council of Tanzania
NGO	Nongovernmental Organization
NTA	National Technical Awards
ODL	Open Distance Learning
OUT	Open University of Tanzania
O-Level	Ordinary Level
PASEC	Programme on the Analysis of Education Systems (Programme d'Analyse des Systèmes Educatifs de la CONFEMEN – Conférence des Ministres d'Education des Pays Ayant le Français en Partage)
PCR	Primary Completion Rate
PEDP	Primary Education Development Plan
PETS	Public Expenditure Tracking Survey
PIRLS	Progress in International Reading Literacy Study
PMO-RALG	Prime Minister's Office - Regional Administration and Local Government
PO-PSM	President's Office - Public Service Management
PSLE	Primary School Leaving Examination
PTR	Pupil-Teacher Ratio
RUCO	Ruaha University College
SACMEQ	The Southern and Eastern Africa Consortium for Monitoring Educational Quality
SADC	Southern African Development Community
SAUT	St. Augustine University of Tanzania
SEDP	Secondary Education Development Plan

SEKUKO	Sebastian Kolowa University College
SJUT	St. John's University of Tanzania
SMC	School Management Committee
SMMUCO	Stefano Moshi Memorial University College
SSA	Sub-Sahara Africa
STHEP	Science, Technology and Higher Education Project
SUA	Sokoine University of Agriculture
SUZA	State University of Zanzibar
TASAF	Tanzania Social Action Fund
TCU	Tanzania Commission for Universities
TDHS	Tanzania Demographic and Health Survey
TDMS	Teacher Development and Management Strategy
TEKU	Teofilo Kisanji University
THMIS	Tanzania HIV/AIDS and Malaria Indicator Survey
TIE	Tanzania Institute of Education
TIMSS	Trend in International Mathematics and Science Study
TSD	Teachers' Service Department
TT	Trade Test
TTC	Teacher Training College
TUDARCO	Tumaini University Dar es Salaam College
TVET	Technical and Vocational Education and Training
UCEZ	University College of Education Zanzibar
UDOM	University of Dodoma
UDSM	University of Dar es Salaam
UoA	University of Arusha
UPE	Universal Primary Education
URT	United Republic of Tanzania
VETA	Vocational Education and Training Authority
VTC	Vocational Training Center
WBUCHS	Weill Bugando University College of Health Sciences
ZU	Zanzibar University